

BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

SCRUTINY BOARD

28th September 2010

RECOMMENDATION TRACKER REPORT

1. SUMMARY

This Recommendation Tracker lists all recommendations made by the Scrutiny Board (including Task Group recommendations) until implementation is complete. The Recommendation Tracker should for each recommendation detail the following information:

- whether the recommendation was agreed by Cabinet (the Cabinet Decision),
- the relevant Cabinet Portfolio Holder,
- which department or agencies will be implementing the agreed recommendations;
- when the agreed recommendations are expected to be implemented by; and
- key outcomes resulting from implementation.

Supplementary evidence to show the outcomes achieved, such as exhibits, photographs, commentary or testimony from external agencies and service users is encouraged to be presented to the Board as a presentation.

The recommendations are grouped in date order and by topic.

2. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 That the Board notes the Quarterly Recommendation Tracker and agrees to the removal of any items which have been completed.

Recommendations by the Scrutiny Board: 24 th November 2009	
TOPIC:	Hot Food Takeaways
PORTFOLIO HOLDER:	Councillor Mrs J. Dyer M.B.E. - Portfolio Holder for Planning
HEAD OF SERVICE:	Steven Jordan – Head of Regulatory Services

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed
1	<p>That the Cabinet task the Strategic Planning Department to scope the extent to which the issues identified in this report contribute to the negative impact on sense of community and well being and the environment and how these issues can be addressed by the adoption of a Supplementary Planning Document on hot food takeaways and present a report detailing their findings and draft policy to the Cabinet.</p> <p>Cabinet Decision: AGREED by Cabinet 2nd December 2009</p> <p>Outcomes</p> <p>Planning officers recommend that Hot Food Take Away SPD cannot be progressed.</p>	No implementation to take place due to inability to prepare SPD.	
2	<p>That the Cabinet refer consideration of the adoption of a draft Supplementary Planning Document on hot food takeaways to the Local Development Framework Working Party to be included as an agenda item and considered at the next scheduled meeting of the Local Development Framework Working Party.</p>	No implementation to take place due to inability to	

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed				
	<table border="1" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 20%;">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td>AGREED by Cabinet 2nd December 2009</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2"><u>Outcomes</u> SPD cannot be prepared; as such, no action for the LDF Working Party.</td> </tr> </table>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd December 2009	<u>Outcomes</u> SPD cannot be prepared; as such, no action for the LDF Working Party.		prepare SPD.	
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd December 2009						
<u>Outcomes</u> SPD cannot be prepared; as such, no action for the LDF Working Party.							
3	<p>That the Cabinet direct officers to carry out further research into healthy eating/ healthy lifestyles and the means by which through working with partners in the LSP the Council could contribute to delivering services to address the LAA targets on obesity in children, mortality rate from circulatory diseases for under 75s, adult participation in sport and children and young people’s participation in high-quality PE and sport. The Board further recommends that a report detailing the findings of the research is presented to Cabinet by June 2010.</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 20%;">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td>AGREED by Cabinet 2nd December 2009</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2"><u>Outcomes</u> A bid was submitted to the Health Improvement Fund earlier this year for a nutritionist to work with selected takeaway outlets to improve the quality of food they offer and to promote a healthy choice on the menu. It was to be a short project of 6 months duration costing approximately £5,000. Unfortunately the bid was not successful. The TRUNK which currently serves the Charford and Sidemoor areas also has a</td> </tr> </table>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd December 2009	<u>Outcomes</u> A bid was submitted to the Health Improvement Fund earlier this year for a nutritionist to work with selected takeaway outlets to improve the quality of food they offer and to promote a healthy choice on the menu. It was to be a short project of 6 months duration costing approximately £5,000. Unfortunately the bid was not successful. The TRUNK which currently serves the Charford and Sidemoor areas also has a			
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd December 2009						
<u>Outcomes</u> A bid was submitted to the Health Improvement Fund earlier this year for a nutritionist to work with selected takeaway outlets to improve the quality of food they offer and to promote a healthy choice on the menu. It was to be a short project of 6 months duration costing approximately £5,000. Unfortunately the bid was not successful. The TRUNK which currently serves the Charford and Sidemoor areas also has a							

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed
	Health and Wellbeing Action Plan.		

Recommendations by the Scrutiny Board: 25th November 2008	
TOPIC:	Refuse and Recycling VFM Scrutiny Investigation
PORTFOLIO HOLDER:	Cllr Mike Webb – Portfolio Holder for Community Services
HEAD OF SERVICE:	Guy Revans - Head of Environmental Services

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed
1	<p>Head of Street Scene and Community</p> <p>Once the chargeable green waste collection service has been implemented and the take up of the service is known, Street Scene officers be requested to investigate the option of providing additional wheelie bins for green waste on request at an additional charge.</p>	April 2010	✓
	<p>Cabinet Decision: AGREED by Cabinet 7th January 2009</p> <p>Decision about feasibility of second bins will be made in April 2009</p>		

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed		
	<p><u>Outcomes</u> Officers are creating a list of requests for second bins as calls for the service are received. It is anticipated that by the end of April take up of the service will have settled and officers will be in a position to make a decision about second bins.</p> <p>2nd bins were offered to those requesting them from the start of May. So far there has been a take up offer of about 50, which are currently operational and the appropriate fees paid.</p>				
2	<p>Officers from Street Scene be requested to monitor on-street recycling trials being undertaken by other Councils to see if there is any evidence to suggest it would provide value for money.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="315 834 1538 943"> <tr> <td data-bbox="315 834 651 943">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td data-bbox="651 834 1538 943">AGREED by Cabinet 7th January 2009</td> </tr> </table> <p><u>Outcomes</u></p> <p>July 2010 Update: We have been monitoring trials run of on street recycling in other authorities.</p> <p>Evidence shows that tonnage collected through on street recycling facilities is poor especially when placed retrospectively in town centres and other similar open spaces; contamination is high with these facilities therefore resulting recycling tonnage is of low quality and low tonnage. However there is a perceived benefit in educating and communicating the recycling message to the public. It is widely</p>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 7th January 2009	<p>April 2010</p> <p>April 2010</p> <p>March 2011</p>	<p>✓</p>
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 7th January 2009				

	acknowledged that there is increased chance of success within controlled environments and for this reason we intend to run a trial at Sanders Park. We will also investigate the installation of on street recycling with the refurbishment of the town centre should the opportunity arise		
3	When the new co-mingled service has been in operation for a minimum of one year, the option of delivering the service using an alternative method (including using a private contractor) be considered to see if it would be an appropriate time for market testing and comparisons to be undertaken.	April 2010 if members support this approach	
	Cabinet Decision: AGREED by Cabinet 7th January 2009		
	<p>Outcomes The co-mingled service will be in operation by April 2010. This means that as recommended, the option of delivering the service using an alternative method can be looked at during 2011/12 at the earliest.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: <i>Is it likely that this will in fact happen in 2011/2012? If not, the reason why not.</i></p> <p>This will now be something that will be considered as part of the transformation process for Environmental Services</p>		

Recommendations by the Scrutiny Steering Board: 4th March 2008	
TOPIC:	Refuse and Recycling Scrutiny Investigation
PORTFOLIO HOLDER:	Cllr Mike Webb – Portfolio Holder for Community Services
HEAD OF SERVICE:	Guy Revans - Head of Environmental Services

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed
1	<p>NVQ Training in Waste Management from WAMITAB (Waste Management Industry Training Advisory Board) via NEW College is given to all refuse and recycling staff over a 2 year period commencing September 2008 with the following conditions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ standards for 'performance criteria' and 'knowledge requirements' specific to this Council are built into the awards; ▪ the preferred primary assessment method is observation (rather than witness testimonies or personal statements); and ▪ that performance criteria is observed consistently over a certain time period rather than as a one-off 	<p>Training in December 2008</p> <p>NEW College registration March 2009</p> <p>Crews to commence course April 2009</p>	✓
	<p>Cabinet Decision: AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</p>		
	<p>Outcomes All negotiations taken place with New College to satisfy the Councils requirements. Presentation to staff and selection of first group to undertake the training will follow.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: <i>1. Was NVQ Training in Waste Management delivered via NEW College?</i></p>		

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed
	<p>NVQ training was delivered via New College</p> <p>2. <i>Were the standards for 'performance criteria' built into the course?</i> Yes the standards for performance criteria were built into the course</p> <p>3. <i>Was observation used as the primary observation method?</i> Yes observation was the primary method used to assess staff</p> <p>4. <i>Was performance criteria observed over a time period? If so, when and what were the results?</i> Yes the observation period was part of the 6 month period it took to undertake the whole course, observation took place from October 2009 to April 2010. The results were that all participants passed the NVQ.</p>	April 2010	✓
2.	<p>The following NVQ training is given to the three Refuse and Recycling Team Leaders:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Team Leading in Refuse and Recycling via NEW College ▪ BITS (Business Improvement Techniques) via RDI (Resource Development International) <p>Cabinet Decision: AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</p> <p>Outcomes Have agreed to get NVQ training organised for the refuse and recycling crews first then organise training for the supervisors. Additional training/Support being organised with the Learning and Organisational Development Manager.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: 1. <i>Was training delivered to the 3 refuse and recycling team leaders?</i> Supervisory and Management training is due to commence Oct 2010 for 4 staff. The training package is currently being put together for all operations supervisors in RBC & BDC. This training will be a bespoke package to reflect the needs of the</p>	November 2009	✓

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed		
	<p>organisation and the individuals involved. The training is due to take a period of 12 months until completion.</p> <p>2. <i>Was this useful?</i> The training identified will be useful to the individuals receiving it and beneficial to the service as a whole.</p> <p>3. <i>Who are they?</i> Kevin Cox Douglas Lloyd Martin Roche Roy Dore</p>	Oct 2010			
4.	<p>Request that Street Scene and Waste Management Officers monitor the progress Worcestershire County Council is making in relation to building their own sorting plant by 2009, as this will enable a commingled recycling service to be launched (making it easier to recycle and likely to encourage more recycling) and therefore significantly improve this Council's recycling rates.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="315 927 1541 1015"> <tr> <td data-bbox="315 927 667 1015">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td data-bbox="667 927 1541 1015">AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</td> </tr> </table> <p><u>Outcomes</u> Officers are attending regular meetings with the County Council. Both officers and Members meet as part of a County wide forum to discuss all waste related issues. A site visit has been organised during March for Heads of Service and Portfolio Holder.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: 1. <i>Did WCC build their own sorting plant? If so, are any photographs available?</i> Yes, see www.envirosort.co.uk. Members were all advised about the facility and the</p>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008		✓
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008				

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed		
	<p>starting date of the new service. We only have photos of the build stage. Please advise if photos are required.</p> <p>2. <i>Did this enable a co-mingled recycling process?</i> Yes, we started comingled collection in April 2010</p>	April 2010	✓		
5.	<p>Street Scene and Waste Management Officers be requested to continue to encourage Worcestershire County Council officers to investigate recycling more materials through the Waste Management Forum.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="315 678 1541 758"> <tr> <td data-bbox="315 678 667 758">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td data-bbox="667 678 1541 758">AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</td> </tr> </table> <p>Outcomes Both officers and Members meet as part of a County wide forum to discuss all waste related issues.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: 1. <i>Do WCC investigate regularly more materials through the Waste Management Forum?</i> Yes, as part of Severn Waste Services' (SWS) contract they undertake regular waste analysis surveys to identify materials recycled and not recycled, from this we can determine the possibility of collecting new waste streams for recycling. As part of this process we are now able to collect thick cardboard, all rigid plastic containers and waxed cartons.</p> <p>2. <i>How much waste is recycled?</i> The early indications are that the comingled collection service is picking up more tonnage that the now redundant kerbside sort service has ceased. During Apr-June</p>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008	<p>April 2010 (and ongoing)</p> <p>April 2010 (and ongoing)</p>	<p>✓</p> <p>✓</p> <p>✓</p>
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008				

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed		
	<p>higher than expected reject rates were experienced at EnviroSort (around 20%). Alterations have now been undertaken at EnviroSort, this has resulted in a reduction from 3 containers of rejects leaving the facility to 1. Although tonnage data will not be available until next month to give actual reject rates, anecdotal evidence suggests that the amendments will have reduced reject levels to around 8%. Further work will be undertaken on the resulting rejects to investigate if any additional modifications can to the facility to reduce them further.</p> <p>For the 1st qtr of 2010-11 the kerbside recycling tonnage collected is predicted to be a 15% increase on that of qtr 1 in 2009.</p>				
6.	<p>Request that Street Scene and Waste Management Officers continue to regularly and systematically benchmark against the top 10-15 local authorities in the recycling league table which are achieving higher recycling rates, with a view to adapting any parts of their services to Bromsgrove which may prove successful in helping to increase our recycling figures.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="315 911 1541 954"> <tr> <td data-bbox="315 911 667 954">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td data-bbox="667 911 1541 954">AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</td> </tr> </table> <p>Outcomes Officers regularly monitor activities through PSNET (The Public Services Network) and APSE (Association of Public Sector Excellence) and technical press.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: <i>Do we benchmark against the top 10-15 local authorities in the recycling league table?</i> We do benchmark against the recycling league tables, we also use other more meaningful data from nearest neighbours, similar services and other Worcestershire districts to constantly review our services.</p>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008	<p>Available end of 2009</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>✓</p> <p>✓</p>
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008				

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed		
7.	<p>Street Scene and Waste Management Officers be requested to continually investigate ways in which the Council can expand the recycling service to reach the remaining 6% of the District.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="315 480 1541 523"> <tr> <td data-bbox="315 480 667 523">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td data-bbox="667 480 1541 523">AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</td> </tr> </table> <p>Outcomes This will only be feasible once the new Materials Reclamation Facility (MRF) is available at the end of 2009. Plant being built by the County Council.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: 1. <i>Is the Materials Reclamation Facility now built and available for use?</i> Yes, see point 4 above 2. <i>Have we expanded recycling? If so, does this now reach the remaining 6% of the District?</i> No, there is potential to expand the service to an additional 3% of households with the current resources available and this is currently being looked at from an operational viewpoint. Subject to additional funding it would be possible to expand coverage to the full 100% however as per the Household Waste Recycling Act 2003, Section 45a; A waste collection authority is not required to offer recycling to all households if 'the cost of doing so is unreasonably high, or, comparable alternative arrangements are available.'</p>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008	Available end of 2009	✓
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008				
8.	In order to educate as many children as possible to take responsibility for the future of their own environment and encourage more recycling throughout the District, Street Scene and Waste Management officers be requested to continue to encourage all schools to join the Eco-School programme, particularly primary schools.				

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed
	<p>Cabinet Decision: AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</p> <p>Outcomes Regular visits to schools by Officers to promote environmental issues.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: <i>1. What have we done to encourage schools to join the Eco-school programme?</i> Support to schools has been by means of talks, loan of literature and equipment, advice. A Sustainable Schools initiative is in place through WCC (as the LEA) and through Bishops Wood via teacher training, pupil visits, curriculum advice etc. <i>2. Have any joined? If so, which ones?</i> Schools have been encouraged to sign up to the EcoSchools programme since around 2000. As at 28/07/10, 33 schools and 4 pre schools are signed up to the EcoSchool Programme (list available).</p>		✓
10.	<p>Request the Head of Street Scene and Waste Management to make certain there is thorough consultation with local residents in relation to the green bin charging arrangements due to be put in place. Effective communication will help ensure smooth implementation of the charging system which should avoid a reduction in customer service standards.</p> <p>Cabinet Decision: AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</p> <p>Outcomes</p> <p>Officer Comment: Consultation underway and first article has been released in 'Together Bromsgrove' (Summer 2008) with planned media releases due to go out in subsequent issues local newspapers and the waste collection calendar.</p>		✓

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed		
	<p>October 2008 Update: Delivery of the waste collection calendar is taking place during October 2008. The next Bromsgrove Together is due November 2008. Further press releases are planned in January 2009.</p> <p>March 2009 Update: Further newspaper adverts have been placed in local papers promoting the service.</p> <p>October 2009 update: Coming to the end of the first year's operation. Over 15,500 applications received and serviced during the season. Currently undertaking publicity and communication for next year's service and the changes to a co-mingled collection recycling service. Currently publicity programme developed following recommendation from Focus group of residents set up to review the process.</p> <p>January 2010 update: Reminder of future changes delivered via Christmas collection postcards w/c 16th November 2009. Recycling booklets will be delivered in March 2010 (actual date to be confirmed) via Royal Mail.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: <i>What was the outcome of the consultation?</i> An article was placed in Together Bromsgrove feeding back on the outcome. Full and comprehensive information has been provided to the Committee Services Officer and can be supplied to any Members who are interested.</p>				
11.	<p>Increase communication with local residents wherever possible to encourage reducing, reusing and recycling. For example, ensuring local residents are aware that they can request more recycling boxes free of charge.</p>		✓		
	<table border="1" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 20%;">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td>AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</td> </tr> </table>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008		
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008				

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed
	<p>Outcomes Information on web site and the waste collection calendar also via the Customer Service Centre (CSC). Various consultation days planned around the District at various Parish Council offices.</p> <p>March 2009 Update: Project team set up to develop co-mingled service from April 2010. This will allow additional and greater volumes of materials to be recycled. Publicity throughout the year will continue to promote these changes.</p> <p>October 2009 update: Current round of communication for co-mingled collection system includes further publicity about various options for recycling.</p> <p>January 2010 update: Reminder of future changes delivered via Christmas collection postcards w/c 16th November 2009.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: <i>Does this continue to happen and do we have evidence to show this?</i> When there are service message to communicate we always carefully consider the ways to engage with our residents. See the communications plan in the additional information to provide an example of the communications work that is undertaken – this is for the recent changes during March & April 2010.</p>		
14.	<p>Updates relating to the refuse and recycling service be included in Members' Bulletins.</p> <p>Cabinet Decision: AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</p>		<p style="text-align: center;">✓ Ongoing</p>
	<p>Officer Comment: Update on green waste collection charges followed by information pack to be</p>		

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed		
	<p>distributed to all members during October 2008.</p> <p>March 2009 Update: Any changes to the service are promoted through the members' bulletin or direct email contact.</p> <p>October 2009 update: Members' presentation evening in July provided all Members and Parish Councils with information pack of service changes. Regular bulletins in various publications throughout year including Together Bromsgrove, Members Bulleting, local press.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: <i>Does this continue to happen and do we have evidence to show this?</i></p> <p>The Members' Bulletin register provides details of information that has been set out together with dates. Full and comprehensive information has been provided to the Committee Services Officer and can be supplied to any Members who are interested.</p>				
15.	<p>The Head of Street Scene and Waste Management be requested to further investigate the effectiveness of various vehicle tracking and communication systems with a view to trialling a model in the future.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="315 965 1541 1010"> <tr> <td data-bbox="315 965 667 1010">Cabinet Decision:</td> <td data-bbox="667 965 1541 1010">AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008</td> </tr> </table> <p>Outcomes</p> <p>Officer Comment:</p> <p>Meetings are being held with various companies offering tracking and communication systems to identify the most appropriate system to use. Once this is established a trial will be undertaken.</p> <p>March 2009 Update:</p> <p>Trial ongoing regular meetings with suppliers to determine value for money (VFM) of system.</p>	Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008		<p style="text-align: center;">✓</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Ongoing</p>
Cabinet Decision:	AGREED by Cabinet 2nd April 2008				

*Rec. No.	Cabinet Decision / Recommendations	Implementation to take place by	Tick if completed
	<p>June 2009 Update: The vehicle tracking system has been trialled on 2 vehicles over the winter months. The monitoring of the system has determined that there is no business case to purchase such a system at present but we continue to monitor prices of such systems which are becoming cheaper and more efficient.</p> <p>July 2010 Update: <i>Any further update?</i> Currently looking at other packages to monitor and manage vehicle performance and optimisation of rounds.</p>		